

August 29, 2014

Mr. John Traversy
Secretary General
Canadian Radio-television and
Telecommunications Commission
Ottawa, Canada
K1A 0N2

**Re: Broadcasting Regulatory Policy CRTC2012-362
Quality Standards for English-language Closed Captioning**

Dear Mr. Traversy:



This report is being filed pursuant to the requirements in BRP 2012-362. We are pleased to note that, subject to the explanation below in respect of the accuracy rate for live programming, TVO has taken the necessary steps to comply with each of the specific requirements set out in the Appendix to BRP 2012-362 relating to efforts to improve the accuracy of captioning.

We have set forth below specific circumstances that address the requirement in BRP 2012-362 relating to the accuracy rate for live programming. As explained below, these circumstances have had an impact on TVO's ability to achieve an immediate 95% average accuracy rate for live programming. We have set out in detail the steps taken in respect of programs that were closed captioned (cc) live-to-air, and the results of accuracy measurements for sample programs that TVO had cc live-to-air for the 2 year period, September 1, 2012 to August 31, 2014.

1. In the summer of 2012 we contacted our cc vendors to remind them of our expectations that they comply with regulatory requirements and industry standards.
2. TVO implemented a process to measure and report the accuracy of 2 programs per month that are broadcast with live-to-air cc beginning in September 2012.
3. At the time our live cc vendor did not achieve 95% accuracy on any of the programs measured. In Broadcast Year 2012/13 the average was 85%.
4. In an effort to improve those results TVO issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) for cc services in the spring of 2013, which stipulated the requirement to achieve compliant levels of accuracy.
5. In September 2013 a new vendor provided live-to-air closed captioning services for TVO. This vendor was able to achieve 95% accuracy twice during the measurement period. In Broadcast Year 2013/14 the average was 89%. A 4% improvement in accuracy over the previous year.

6. Through discussions with our vendor we learned that accuracy rates can decrease on occasions when a replacement cc operator is required. In addition, because TVO programs are commercial free, live-to-air cc for TVO programs are comparatively more challenging assignments given the need to caption non-stop for the duration of the program.
7. In an effort to support the cc vendor in achieving high accuracy rates, TVO provides show run-down sheets to the caption operator in advance, and tests each live cc feed just before broadcast to minimize the risk of missing cc at the beginning of the program.
8. TVO also tested computer generated cc in December 2013. We compared the accuracy achieved with a computer program and a cc operator. For one television program the computer accuracy was 75% compared to 89% for the cc operator. On another television program the computer accuracy was 54% compared to 91% for the cc operator. We found that the computer generated cc does not work well if one person speaks over another, or if there is background sound.

We continue to work in collaboration with our CC vendor to provide comprehensive CC services to TVO viewers with a view to achieving the 95% quality standard with respect to live captioning.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions or concerns.

Sincerely,



Erika Kramer
VP Production, Distribution & Administration
Tel: 416-484-2638
Email: ekramer@tvo.org

cc Lisa de Wilde, CEO

TVO LIVE TO AIR CLOSED CAPTIONING ACCURACY REPORT 2012/13 Broadcast Year

	BPN	Series and Content Title	Date Aired	% Of Accuracy (N-Sup-Sub-I)/N*100	N (# words in the audio)	Sup (# suppressed words)	Sub (# substituted words)	I (# inserted words)
SEPTEMBER 2012	112607	Queen's Park This Week (Week of September 10-13, 2012)	2012-09-16	74	4,584	897	106	185
	011417	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (Dead Money and Still-Too-Big Banks)	2012-09-06	80	10,132	1739	204	112
OCTOBER 2012	112617	Queen's Park This Week (October 15, 2012)	2012-10-21	91	3,937	280	38	55
	011435	The Agenda with Steve Paikin ("Truthiness" in Journalism)	2012-10-01	77	11,070	2258	217	103
NOVEMBER 2012	011902	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (Deep Pockets and Discourse)	2012-11-05	94	10,024	405	63	87
	011905	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (The Mental Health of Ontario's Police)	2012-11-08	80	10,259	1,858	109	51
DECEMBER 2012	011924	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (Corrupting Canada and Pegging Property Values)	2012-12-05	82	8,259	1,314	98	94
	011927	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (Stronach's Politics and Applebaum's Eastern Europe)	2012-12-10	77	9,664	1,960	123	146
JANUARY 2013	011945	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (Loosening Ties to the LCBO and Ontario's Next Premier?)	2013-01-14	80	10,044	1832	46	128
	011956	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (The Teacher's Turn)	2013-01-29	93	9,201	614	35	32
FEBRUARY 2013	112609	Queen's Park This Week (Queen's Park This Week: Week of February 19-21, 2013)	2013-02-24	86	4,079	466	90	23
	011997	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (Modern Medicine, Modern Reality)	2013-02-04	88	9,302	1,021	40	26
MARCH 2013	112619	Queen's Park This Week (Queen's Park This Week: March 4-7, 2013)	2013-03-10	83	3,063	415	36	84
	012362	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (The Agenda This Week and Living with Autism)	2013-03-29	87	9,482	1,137	105	34
APRIL 2013	111597	Queen's Park This Week (Queen's Park This Week: April 8-11, 2013)	2013-04-14	86	4,122	524	49	11
	011297	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (Future Faith)	2013-04-02	87	7,921	908	61	33
MAY 2013	112439	Queen's Park This Week (May 13-17, 2013)	2013-05-19	90	3,675	195	114	46
	012372	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (Mental Health Matters: New Home, New Problems?)	2013-05-06	90	8,342	738	65	41
June 2013	112441	Queen's Park This Week (Queen's Park This Week: June 3-6, 2013)	2013-06-09	87	3,847	392	58	54
	013316	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (From Athens to Mogadishu)	2013-06-04	92	8,666	628	77	16
July 2013		No live CC						
August 2013		No live CC						
Broadcast Year 12/13 Average Accuracy %				85				

Legend:

N = Number of words in the audio

Sup = number of suppressed words (words present in the audio but absent from the captions)

Sub = number of substituted (words in the audio replaced with other words in the captions)

I = number of inserted words (words present in the captions but absent from the audio)

TVO LIVE TO AIR CLOSED CAPTIONING ACCURACY REPORT 2013/14 Broadcast Year

	BPN	Series and Content Title	Date Aired	% Of Accuracy (N-Sup-Sub-I)/N*100	N (# words in the audio)	Sup (# suppressed words)	Sub (# substituted words)	I (# inserted words)
SEPTEMBER 2013	112443	Queen's Park This Week (September 9-12, 2013)	2013-09-15	93	4,264	220	61	14
	013339	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (From the Young Horse's Mouth)	2013-09-09	87	11,651	1,238	205	57
OCTOBER 2013	112450	Queen's Park This Week (The Provincial Deficit, Job Creation, The Energy...)	2013-10-13	92	4,012	245	43	42
	013363	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (An American Privilege at Risk...)	2013-10-18	94	9,327	473	29	60
NOVEMBER 2013	112449	Queen's Park This Week (Queen's Park This Week -October 28-31, 2013)	2013-11-03	87	4,387	409	112	35
	013388	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (Ford Party Politics)	2013-11-14	90	10,020	845	79	50
DECEMBER 2013	112453	Queen's Park This Week (December 2-5, 2013)	2013-12-08	87	4,467	476	106	16
	013413	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (Through the Lens)	2013-12-18	90	9,215	856	65	21
JANUARY 2014	013419	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (Show Me the (Government) Money)	2014-01-09	70	10,562	2614	442	82
	013426	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (Mysteries of the Mind: Get Smart)	2014-01-20	95	8,998	292	112	27
FEBRUARY 2014	112455	Queen's Park This Week (Queen's Park This Week : February 18-20, 2014)	2014-02-23	85	4,320	530	116	23
	013437	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (What's in a Wage?)	2014-02-04	78	9,747	1,614	359	123
MARCH 2014	112456	Queen's Park This Week (Episode 23)	2014-03-03	94	4,025	233	38	14
	013458	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (A Place to Grow?)	2014-03-05	91	10,010	818	103	61
APRIL 2014	116666	Queen's Park This Week (Queen's Park This Week: March 31-April 3, 2014)	2014-04-06	95	4,082	151	27	15
	013193	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (Development or Displacement?)	2014-04-01	78	9,129	1,698	220	96
MAY 2014	116669	Queen's Park This Week (Queen's Park This Week: April 28- May 1, 2014)	2014-05-04	90	3,724	267	61	32
	013265	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (Opening Ontario's Books)	2014-05-01	89	10,465	991	122	42
June 2014	13477	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (The Election Agenda: The Leaders' Debate)	6/3/2014	92	10,999	776	91	52
	13487	The Agenda with Steve Paikin (The Election Agenda: What Happened?)	6/13/2014	93	10,678	721	52	15
July 2014		No live CC						
August 2014		No live CC						
Broadcast Year 13/14 Average Accuracy %				89				

Legend:

N = Number of words in the audio

Sup = number of suppressed words (words present in the audio but absent from the captions)

Sub = number of substituted (words in the audio replaced with other words in the captions)

I = number of inserted words (words present in the captions but absent from the audio)